



Planetary transits and stellar variability

Suzanne Aigrain

Institute of Astronomy & Corpus Christi College, Cambridge

A dissertation submitted to the University of Cambridge
for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

January 25, 2005

The picture on the previous page is a composite of images taken during the transit of Venus on 8 June 2004 with the Solar X-ray imager (SXI) on the GOES-12 spacecraft. It was produced by the US National Oceanographic and Atmospheric Administration (NOAA) and downloaded from www.solarviews.com. It points to one of the main difficulties in detecting transits of a terrestrial planet: the intrinsic variability of late-type stars, a major part of which is due to magnetically induced photospheric features at the base of the X-ray bright coronal loops visible here.

Summary

Most of the 130 or so exo-planets (planets orbiting a star other than the Sun) known to date, were detected via the radial velocity (RV) method, which relies on the spectroscopic detection of changes in the parent star's radial velocity as it orbits the star-planet system's centre of mass. Another promising method relies on the detection, in stellar photometric time series, of the periodic dips caused by planets as they cross the disk of their parent star: planetary transits.

Many ground-based transit search projects have been operating for several years and are expected to come to fruition soon – a handful of planets detected via their transits have been confirmed already. From the ground, both transit and RV methods are limited to giant planets. Several space-based transit search missions are thus planned to probe the terrestrial and habitable planet regimes. The preparation of data analysis tools for these missions, in particular COROT and *Eddington*, has been the focus of my PhD, with potential application to ground-based data as a secondary objective.

I first developed and tested an algorithm for the automated detection of transits in white noise, a challenge due to the rare, brief and shallow nature of the transits. One of the most important noise sources for future space-based missions is the intrinsic low-amplitude variability of the parent star on timescales of tens of minutes to weeks. I constructed an empirical model of this 'stellar micro-variability' to simulate realistic light curves for a variety of stars, and developed filters to remove micro-variability. Monte Carlo simulations were used to test the performance of these tools alone and in combination, and to identify which types of stars make the most promising targets for *Eddington* & COROT.

The algorithms' performance was tested against that of others by participating in the COROT transit detection blind exercise, in which a number of groups from across Europe applied their algorithms to a set of simulated light curves of content known only to a game master. A transit search was also performed in 5 nights of data obtained in 2003 by the UNSW transit search team using the 0.5 APT telescope in Siding Springs Observatory in the field of open cluster NGC 6633, and a handful of transit candidates with depths below 50 mmag were identified.

Declaration

I hereby declare that this thesis entitled *Planetary transits and stellar variability* is not substantially the same as any that I have submitted for a degree, diploma or other qualification at this or any other university. This thesis is less than 60 000 words in length. Parts of this thesis were published in the following articles and conference proceedings:

- *Practical planet prospecting*
Aigrain, S., Irwin, M., 2004
Monthly Notices of the Royal Astronomical Society, vol. 350, pp. 331–345.
- *Characterising stellar micro-variability for planetary transit searches*
Aigrain, S., Favata, F., Gilmore, G., 2004
Astronomy & Astrophysics, vol. 414, pp. 1139–1152.
- *Impact of stellar micro-variability on Eddington’s planet-finding capability*
Aigrain, S., Favata, F., Gilmore, G., 2004
in ‘Stellar structure and habitable planet finding’, 2nd Eddington Workshop, ed. F. Favata & S. Aigrain, ESA SP-538, pp. 215–224.
- *Detecting planetary transits in the presence of stellar variability. Optimal filtering and the use of colour information*
Carpano, S., Aigrain, S., Favata, F., 2003
Astronomy & Astrophysics, vol. 401, pp. 743–753
- *The Frequency Content of the VIRGO/SoHO Light Curves: Implications for Planetary Transit Detection from Space*
Aigrain, S., Gilmore, G., Favata, F., Carpano, S., 2003
in ‘Scientific Frontiers in Research on Extrasolar Planets’, ed. D. Deming & S. Seager, ASP Conference Series, vol. 294, pp. 441–444.
- *Bayesian detection of planetary transits. A modified version of the Gregory-Loredo method for Bayesian periodic signal detection*
Aigrain, S., Favata, F., Gilmore, G., 2002
Astronomy & Astrophysics, vol. 395, pp. 625–636.
- *A Bayesian algorithm for the detection of planetary transits*
Aigrain, S., Gilmore, G., Favata, F., 2001
in ‘Techniques for the detection of planets and life beyond the solar system’, 4th Annual ROE Workshop, ed. W. R. F. Dent, p. 8.

This thesis is essentially my own work. However, some of the work presented therein

was done in collaboration with others, as detailed below:

- Chapter 2
The Bayesian algorithm presented in Section 2.1 is essentially my own work but benefited from regular discussions with and advice from F. Favata throughout its development and testing. The box-shaped transit finder was developed in collaboration with M. Irwin. Its implementation and initial testing were carried out in parallel by both of us, though the final Monte Carlo tests are my own work.
- Chapter 3
The work presented in this Chapter is essentially my own, but benefited from regular discussions with F. Favata and G. Gilmore, and comments from A. Lanza.
- Chapter 4
The starting point for the work presented in this chapter was the optimal filter described in Carpano et al. (2003), which was developed by S. Carpano with contributions from F. Favata and myself. The filters presented in this Chapter were developed in collaboration with M. Irwin, their implementation and testing being carried out in parallel by both of us.
- Chapter 5
The work presented in this chapter is essentially my own but benefited from discussions with F. Favata, G. Gilmore and M. Irwin, as well as with M. Auvergne for the COROT simulations.
- Chapter 6
This Chapter describes the COROT blind exercise, which was carried out by a collaboration led by C. Moutou with the following participants besides myself: M. Auvergne, P. Barge, D. Blouin, R. Cautain, A. R. Erikson, V. Guis, P. Guterman, M. Irwin, A. F. Lanza, F. Pont, H. Rauer, H. Voss and S. Zucker. Sections which describe work that was not my own were included when deemed necessary to place my work in context. The contents of Section 6.1 are the result of discussions between all the participants. The contents of Section 6.2 are primarily the work of others except for Subsection 6.2.3 which describes two sets of stellar light curves, one simulated by myself and one by A. Lanza. Section 6.3 contains work carried out by myself in collaboration with M. Irwin, except for Subsection 6.3.2, which summarises the methods used by the other participating teams for comparison. The contents of Sections 6.4 and 6.4.3.1 are essentially my own although they benefited from discussions with M. Irwin.

Acknowledgements

During the three years this thesis was in the making, three people in particular have guided and encouraged me. Fabio, who first got me into this transit business – albeit by bribing me with some fantastic sailing –, who has been a continuous source of advice and discussions since then, who gave me my first editing experience, and who kept a watchful eye over my work from afar with his customary attention to detail. Gerry, who agreed to supervise my project and gave me complete freedom to pursue it, with the occasional confidence building seal of approval, who helped me see my work in the wider context, and who was the provider of the life-saving loA espresso machine. Mike, who applied his time, his mind, his tremendous experience and his patience to help me grab problems by the roots and shake them till only what mattered was left, and for those evenings spent chatting in the pub, wine-tasting or watching Shakespeare. To all three, thanks also for proof-reading this thesis and providing many suggestions for its improvement.

I would also like to thank Keith Horne and Wyn Evans for agreeing to be my examiners.

I am indebted to Thierry Appourchaux and the VIRGO team at ESTEC for access to VIRGO data, to Derek Buzasi for access to WIRE data, to Rachel Street and the St Andrews exo-planet team for access to data from their INT transit search, to the UNSW transit search team for access to APT data, and to Floor van Leeuwen for extracting Hipparcos light curves from the database for me. This research has made use of the NASA ADS service and the SIMBAD database operated by CDS (Strasbourg), and was supported by studentships from PPARC & the Isaac Newton Trust.

Thanks to John Webb and Marton Hidas for inviting me to Australia where I had a fantastic time, to Leslie for being such a great observing companion. I had many useful discussions with the members of the loA Stellar Populations and Star Formation Groups, with Andrew Collier-Cameron, Keith Horne, Jon Jenkins, Hans Kjeldsen, Nuccio Lanza, Mark McCaughrean, Sergio Messina, Giusi Micela and Sami Solanki. A special thanks to Magali Deleuil, Claire Moutou, Pierre Barge, and to Annie Baglin and the COROT community as a whole.

Thanks to the loA helpdesk, administrators, secretaries and support staff for their invaluable help and their friendliness, and to Max Pettini and Paul Hewett for being so helpful us graduate students. I am fondly indebted to Alan, Bunkie, Carine, Daniel, Edu, Elena, Estelle, Giuseppe, Justin, Lisa, Lola, Max, Michelle, Mike, Muon, Neil, Weimin and all the loA students and postdocs for making the loA such a great

place to work and be. A special mention for Simon who, besides sharing everything from cigarettes, coffee, books, music and films to dancing, holidays, the occasional work-related chat (honest), the panic ridden TAC proposal deadlines and some fun observing, graciously – though perhaps not always entirely willingly – provided me and those who visited my office with subject material for my white board cartoons. By the way, I challenge you to have your kitchen floor done by the time of my viva.

Thanks to Rosemary, Cathie, Robin, Rory, Sangam and everyone at 9 Adams Road, for a very special place to live, to Ed, Ze, Ben, Merav, Pete, Theo, Carl for dinners, dancing, parties and general misbehaviour (long live the bouncing pixies), and to Celine, Rory and Amy, Jago and Vanita, Tom Simon, Javi, Corin, Alistram, Jan, Sophie, for being friends and good times further afield.

Mireille et Philippe, Loulou, Michel et Geo, Mounette et Papy, pour la vie, l'appétit (de vivre, d'apprendre, des bonnes choses, culinaires et autres), la montagne, les livres, pour avoir répondu a mes questions, pour l'ouverture (d'esprit, de toutes les possibilités). Jude, Terry and Mary for being a second family.

And Tom, for being there, and being Tom.

Contents

| | | |
|----------|----------------------------------------------------------------|-----------|
| 1 | Introduction | 1 |
| 1.1 | Searching for extra-solar planets | 1 |
| 1.1.1 | Context and motivation | 3 |
| 1.1.2 | Exo-planet detection methods | 4 |
| 1.1.3 | Properties of known extra-solar planets | 12 |
| 1.2 | Current and planned transit searches | 19 |
| 1.2.1 | Ground-based | 19 |
| 1.2.2 | Space-based transit searches | 26 |
| 1.2.3 | Terrestrial and habitable regimes: | 27 |
| 1.3 | The broader perspective | 36 |
| 1.3.1 | The time domain in astrophysics | 36 |
| 1.3.2 | Additional science from transit search data | 37 |
| 1.3.3 | Application of transit search tools to other data | 38 |
| 1.4 | Structure of the thesis | 38 |
| 2 | Transit detection algorithms | 39 |
| 2.1 | A Bayesian, step-function based algorithm | 41 |
| 2.1.1 | Derivation of the algorithm | 42 |
| 2.1.2 | Comparison with the original GL method | 50 |
| 2.1.3 | Performance evaluation in white Gaussian noise | 53 |
| 2.1.4 | Tests with solar micro-variability | 63 |
| 2.2 | A stripped-down box-shaped transit finder | 68 |
| 2.2.1 | Likelihood maximisation in Gaussian noise | 69 |
| 2.2.2 | Simplification of the algorithm | 70 |
| 2.2.3 | Improvements in the implementation | 77 |
| 2.2.4 | Performance evaluation | 79 |
| 2.2.5 | Discussion and future work | 81 |
| 3 | Characterising and simulating stellar micro-variability | 83 |
| 3.1 | Introduction | 83 |

| | | |
|----------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------|
| 3.2 | Clues from solar irradiance variations | 85 |
| 3.2.1 | SoHO/VIRGO total irradiance (PMO6) data | 86 |
| 3.2.2 | Modelling the 'solar background' | 87 |
| 3.2.3 | Evolution of the power spectrum with the activity cycle | 88 |
| 3.3 | Empirical scaling to other stars | 90 |
| 3.3.1 | The amplitude of the active regions component | 91 |
| 3.3.2 | Other parameters of the model | 98 |
| 3.4 | Testing the model | 101 |
| 3.4.1 | Mimicking the Sun | 101 |
| 3.4.2 | Trends with age and mass | 102 |
| 3.4.3 | Behaviour at high activity | 103 |
| 3.5 | Discussion | 105 |
| 4 | Variability filters | 107 |
| 4.1 | Introduction | 107 |
| 4.2 | Wiener or matched filtering approach | 109 |
| 4.3 | Least-squares fitting | 113 |
| 4.4 | Non-linear filtering | 115 |
| 4.5 | Light curve characteristics after filtering | 118 |
| 4.6 | Discussion | 119 |
| 5 | Impact of stellar micro-variability on transit detection from space | 123 |
| 5.1 | Introduction | 123 |
| 5.2 | Simulations to identify the best target stars for <i>Eddington</i> | 124 |
| 5.2.1 | Which are the best target stars for <i>Eddington</i> ? | 125 |
| 5.2.2 | Minimum detectable transit in the presence of variability | 128 |
| 5.2.3 | Relevance to <i>Kepler</i> | 129 |
| 5.3 | Performance of the non-linear filter plus box shaped transit finder | 130 |
| 5.3.1 | Preliminary tests | 130 |
| 5.3.2 | Monte Carlo simulations for <i>Eddington</i> | 130 |
| 5.3.3 | COROT simulations | 134 |
| 5.4 | Discussion | 135 |
| 6 | The COROT blind experiment | 137 |
| 6.1 | Introduction | 137 |
| 6.1.1 | Purpose of the blind experiment | 138 |
| 6.1.2 | Participants | 138 |
| 6.2 | The simulated light curves | 139 |
| 6.2.1 | General characteristics | 139 |

| | | |
|----------|--------------------------------------------------------------|------------|
| 6.2.2 | Instrumental and photon noise | 139 |
| 6.2.3 | Stellar micro-variability | 140 |
| 6.2.4 | Transit signals | 142 |
| 6.2.5 | Stellar mimics and variables | 143 |
| 6.2.6 | Background pollution | 143 |
| 6.2.7 | The final set of 1001 light curves | 143 |
| 6.3 | The transit search | 144 |
| 6.3.1 | Method used by the loA team (team 5) | 145 |
| 6.3.2 | Methods used by the other teams | 155 |
| 6.4 | Discussion of the results | 156 |
| 6.4.1 | Relative performances of the various groups | 157 |
| 6.4.2 | Overall results and implications | 159 |
| 6.4.3 | Lessons learnt | 161 |
| 6.5 | Future prospects for COROT blind exercises | 167 |
| 7 | Application to ground-based data | 177 |
| 7.1 | The data | 177 |
| 7.1.1 | Telescope and instrument | 177 |
| 7.1.2 | Target | 179 |
| 7.1.3 | Data reduction and photometry | 179 |
| 7.1.4 | Post-processing | 180 |
| 7.2 | Transit search | 183 |
| 7.3 | Discussion | 185 |
| 8 | Conclusions | 201 |
| 8.1 | Data analysis tools for planetary transit searches | 201 |
| 8.2 | Applications | 202 |
| 8.3 | Future improvements | 203 |
| 8.4 | Additional tools | 203 |

